IMPACTS OF CORNERSTONE READING TUTORIAL PROGRAM

Felisa D. Manug, Ernesto S. Manug, Ma. Danessa S. Rabia, Ma. Aezel M. Aguanza, Katrine Mae B. Mante, John Ferwin Z. Camargo, Mae A. Evardo, and Ernesto C. Rulida

Bohol Island State University – Calape Campus
Calape, Bohol, Philippines

ABSTRACT

This study aimed to evaluate the impacts of the Cornerstone Reading Tutorial Program conducted by the Bohol Island State University - Calape Campus, College of Teacher Education in Calape Central Elementary School, Calape, Bohol for the school year 2014-2016. This was done spearheaded by the Couples for Christ (CFC) - Answering the Cry of the Poor (ANCOP) in their program called "Building the Church of the Poor (BCOP) and the Department of Education. Study results showed that the tutorial program is effective in increasing the pupil's reading proficiency level based on Dolch Basic Sight Vocabulary Test results and English performance based on English grades. Hereafter, the tutorial program produces positive impact to the students' reading proficiency and English performance. Moreover, the reading proficiency level of the pupils are related to their English performance. The progress of the pupil's reading proficiency level through the tutorial program will help them increase their English performance in school. Thus, the Cornerstone Reading Tutorial Program is much effective and must be done in the next years to help shape the mind of pupils, especially in the skill of reading.

Keywords: Dolch Basic Sight Vocabulary Test, Cornerstone Reading Tutorial, Reading Tutorial

INTRODUCTION

Rationale

Reading, as described by Gough and Tunmer (1986) in their work *Simple View of Reading* is a product of reading as word recognition or decoding and linguistic comprehension wherein these factors are viewed as of equal importance. It is a series of activity that starts with word recognition and ends with comprehension. The skill to recognize words and texts and understand instructions is fundamental in all subjects. Reading, therefore, is a vital requirement for learning and the inability to read impedes the ability to grasp other necessary skills and is also crucial to academic achievement (Kirsh *et al.,* 2002). Consequently, the United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization (1983) describes reading as "the means by which literate persons can gain access to the vast and varied supply of knowledge and experiences that has been preserved in written form".

In a study of Catts, *et al.* (2016), the students with difficulty in reading in kindergarten was predicted to have difficulty in word recognition even after third grade. These type of readers would

likely require intensive reading-instruction throughout primary years (Peng, 2018). Accordingly, an estimate of 75 to 90 percent of students who struggled in comprehension have reading fluency issues significantly correlated to comprehension difficulty (Duke, Pressley, & Hilden, 2004 as cited by Estrada 2016). This means that these students can benefit from tutorials and other intervention to enhance their word decoding skills. Likewise, it must be done early during the time when the teacher and teaching strategy focuses on word decoding rather than on the later grade level where reading comprehension is the focus.

In the Philippines, Department of Education last 2013 had set standards for grades 1, 2 and 3 on the number of correct words per minute a student should attain. On the following years, inventory of student's reading was monitored and it was found out that there is about 50% and even less than half of the set standards were obtained by students. Students are categorized based on their fluency to read as first readers, second readers, third readers or students with reading difficulty. Consequently, classifying students based on this criteria only means there is an issue on which needs to be addressed.

A tutor-tutee relationship that enhanced learning can be explained by the Vygotskian perspective (William & Severino, 2004). A tutor, a person who can be a peer or someone aside from the teacher, can easily adjust to a level that is easily understood by the tutee (Sookyong Cho, 2017) which the Vygostskian perspective also referred to as the more capable peer (Solso, 2009). The paper of Sookyong Cho (2017) also emphasized that if the tutor and tutees have the same mother tongue, it lessens the anxiety of the tutees once they use another language, in this case *English*. Furthermore, it is also a tool to scaffold the performance and comprehension of the tutees. As study of Josephs and Jolivette (2016) also supported that in peer mediated reading tutorial, reading fluency of tutees have increase. A similar study by Angeli dos Santos (2017) also showed that there is positive impact on the reading fluency of the students who participated as tutees.

One of the two levels of Cornerstone is the Reading Tutorial Program conducted on selected Elementary schools which aimed to reach out to children who are slow readers in elementary public schools through Reading Tutorials. (Cornerstone, n.d.) The Calape Central Elementary School has been chosen as one facets to the conduct of the program. Each year 30 pupils were identified as beneficiaries of the program who had attended 20 Saturday tutorial classes each year.

Moreover, Cornerstone provides a venue for the volunteers to serve and express their love for children through the reading tutorial of slow readers in Grade 2 and 3. (Cornerstone, n.d.) With this, Bohol Island State University – Calape Campus is very much privilege to extend its arms as the co-partner educational institution by providing 30 volunteers who will serve as the tutors in the one-to-one tutorial program each year.

Even with the efforts of the teachers to help the students in their reading development skills, some of the elementary students failed to do so. In an attempt to minimize this problem, the researchers examined the impact of reading tutorial by the collaboration of CFC-ANCOP and College of Teacher Education of Bohol Island State University - Calape Campus in Calape Central Elementary School, Calape, Bohol for the school year 2014-2016. Any result derived on this study

will constitute to the enhancement of the continuous implementation of the program to better serve the clients, the academe and the partners.

METHODS

The researcher employed quantitative-correlational research design. The respondents of the Cornerstone Reading Tutorial Program were the 30 slow readers per batch which totaled to 90 participants for three-year implementation of the Cornerstone Reading Tutorial, from 2014-2016. This study aimed to examine the impact and continuousness of the tutorial program by analyzing the respondent's reading proficiency level and English performance. To describe the pupil's reading proficiency level, the researchers used the Dolch Basic Sight Vocabulary Test results before and after the conduct of the tutorial program. On the other hand, to describe the pupil's English performance, the researcher used the English 1st and 3rd quarter grades. In detail, this study also analyzed if there is a significant difference on the pupils' reading proficiency level and the English performance before and after the conduct of the program. Furthermore, it weighed the relationship between the respondents' reading proficiency level and English performance after the conduct of the tutorial program.

Statistically, to test if there is a significant difference on the respondents' reading proficiency level and the English performance before and after the conduct of the Cornerstone Reading Tutorial Program, the correlated t-test was used. Moreover, to test if there is a significant relationship between the respondents' reading proficiency level and English performance after the conduct of the Cornerstone Reading Tutorial Program, the Pearson-Product Moment Correlation was used.

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

Table 1 shows the respondent's reading proficiency level in terms of their Dolch Basic Sight Vocabulary Test results for three-year implementation of Cornerstone Reading Tutorial. On the first batch, the result showed that 3 from 8 tutees are categorized as *Pre-Primer* after participating the Cornerstone Reading Tutorial Program. All of the pupils in the *Primer level* had improved to higher reading proficiency level. Eleven from 6 tutees became for each of the 1st and 2nd reader level. Moreover, 5 from 0 tutees are categorized as *3rd Reader*. There is a percentage increase of 49.52% on the reading proficiency level of the participating tutees for this school year.

Table 1

Respondent's Profile in terms of Dolch Basic Sight Vocabulary Test

School Year	Scores	Description	Before Tutorial		After Tutorial	
			f	**%**	*f*	**%**
Ist batch	211 – 220	3rd Reader	0	0.00	5	16.67

n=30	171 – 210	2nd Reader	6	20.00	11	36.67
	121 – 170	1st Reader	6	20.00	11	36.67
	76 – 120	Primer	10	33.33	0	0.00
	0 – 75	Pre-Primer	8	26.67	3	10.00
	Average Score		111.47		166.67	
	Description		Primer		1st Reader	
	Percentage Increase		49.52%			
2nd batch n=30	211 – 220	3rd Reader	0	0.00	5	16.67
	171 – 210	2nd Reader	4	13.33	17	56.67
	121 – 170	1st Reader	16	53.33	7	23.33
	76 – 120	Primer	10	33.33	1	3.33
	0 – 75	Pre-Primer	0	0.00	0	0.00
	Average Score		138.80		179.97	
	Description		1st Reader		2nd Reader	
	Percentage Increase		29.66%			
3rd batch n=30	211 – 220	3rd Reader	2	6.67	11	36.67
	171 – 210	2nd Reader	15	50.00	17	56.67
	121 – 170	1st Reader	10	33.33	1	3.33
	76 – 120	Primer	2	6.67	1	3.33
	0 – 75	Pre-Primer	1	3.33	0	0.00
	Average Score		164.00		197.47	
	Description		1st Reader		2nd Reader	
	Percentage Increase		20.40%			
OVERALL n=90	211 – 220	3rd Reader	2	2.22	21	23.33
	171 – 210	2nd Reader	25	27.78	45	50.00
	121 – 170	1st Reader	32	35.56	19	21.11
	76 – 120	Primer	22	24.44	2	2.22
	0 – 75	Pre-Primer	9	10.00	3	3.33
	Average Score		137.76		181.37	
	Description		1st Reader		2nd Reader	
	Percentage Increase		31.67%			

In addition, it displays the respondent's reading proficiency level based on their Dolch Basic Sight Vocabulary Test results for the program's second batch. The result showed that no tutees are categorized as *Pre-Primer* before and after participating the Cornerstone Reading Tutorial Program. Only 1 from 10 tutees stays in the *Primer level* while 7 from 16 tutees remains in the *1st reader* level. Seventeen from 4 tutees became *2nd reader* level. Moreover, 5 from 0 tutees are categorized as *3rd Reader*. There is a percentage increase of 29.66% on the reading proficiency level of the participating tutees for this school year. Furthermore, it also presents the 3rd batch respondent's reading proficiency level based on their Dolch Basic Sight Vocabulary Test results. The table exposed that the only one tutee categorized as *Pre-Primer* had improved to higher level

and the two tutees decreased to 1 tutee categorized as *Primer* had improved after participating in the Cornerstone Reading Tutorial Program. Only 1 from 10 tutees stays in the *1st reader level*. Then, 17 from 15 tutees were in the *2nd reader* level and 11 from 2 tutees are categorized as *3rd Reader*. There is a percentage increase of 20.40% on the reading proficiency level of the participating tutees for this school year.

Generally, Table 1 also shows the combined reading proficiency level of all the respondents for the three school years based on their Dolch Basic Sight Vocabulary Test results. After participating the Cornerstone Reading Tutorial Program, 3 from 9 tutees, 2 from 22, and 19 from 32 tutees was categorized as *Pre-Primer*, *Primer,* and *1st reader* respectively. Moreover, 25 increased to 45 tutees and 2 increased to 21 tutees were in the *2nd reader* and *3rd reader* level. There is an overall percentage increase of 31.67% on the reading proficiency level of the all participating tutees for the three school years.

Table 2 shows the summary of result of correlated *t-test* for the analysis of Dolch Basic Sight Vocabulary Test results of the three batches of respondents. First batch shows significant difference between before and after tutorial class for the three school years of implementation. This implies that the Reading Tutorial Class is effective in increasing the reading performance of the tutees.

Table 2

Analysis of Dolch Basic Sight Vocabulary Test Results

School Year	Sources of Variation	Mean	Degree of Freedom	Computed t-value	Tabular t-value	Decision	Interpretation
				at 0.05 level of significance			
1st bacth	Before the Reading Tutorial Program	111.47	29	– 9.492	± 2.045	Reject H_o	Significant Difference
	After the Reading Tutorial Program	166.67					
2nd batch	Before the Reading Tutorial Program	137.80	29	– 9.020	± 2.045	Reject H_o	Significant Difference

	After the Reading Tutorial Program	179.97					
3rd batch	Before the Reading Tutorial Program	164.00	29	− 6.575	± 2.045	Reject H_o	Significant Difference
	After the Reading Tutorial Program	197.47					
OVERALL	Before the Reading Tutorial Program	137.76	89	− 13.962	± 1.987	Reject H_o	Significant Difference
	After the Reading Tutorial Program	181.37					

Findings show that the Cornerstone Reading Tutorial Program had positive impact on its participants. Many of the participants had improved from one to two level higher after they joined in the program. This results affirmed Dorval, Wallach, & Wallach (1978) that tutorial program for low-reader is effective in establishing reading competencies. Beebe & Balasa (1976) also mentioned that tutorial reading activities can give pupils an excellent start in independent decoding skills.

The respondent's profile in terms of English performance is shown in Table 3. On the first batch of implementation, there are 11 and 19 respondents who are at the *Fairly Satisfactory* and *Did Not Meet the Expectation* level respectively. After the tutorial classes, a varied result was observed. From 11 tutees who are Fairly Satisfactory at the beginning of the tutorial program, it became 21 after and the 19 tutees who are in *Did Not Meet the Expectation* level is trimmed down to 9 tutees after. The table also shows the computed average score before the tutorial program is 73.33 increased to 74.63 wherein both fall on the *Did Not meet the Expectation* level and depicts a 1.30% average increase.

In addition, Table 2 also displays the 2nd batch's composition, 29 *Fairly Satisfactory* and 9 *Did Not meet the Expectation*. After the tutorial program, of the 9 tutees, 2 remained to be in the *Did Not meet the Expectation* level and of the 21 tutees, 27 became *Fairly Satisfactory*. One tutee rise up to *Satisfactory* level after the tutorial program. Reflected also in the table is the average score of 75.07% before the tutorial program and 76.07% with an average increase of 1.00% increase in terms of English performance is observed after the tutorial.

Furthermore, the table also displays the 3rd batch tutees' English performance. There are three *Did Not Meet the Expectation*, 21 *Fairly Satisfactory*, 5 *Satisfactory* and 1 *Outstanding*. After the tutorial program, the 3 *Did Not Meet the Expectation* is decreased to 1, 21 *Fairly Satisfactory* increased to 22, 5 *Satisfactory* increased to 7. It also displays the average score of 75.18% before the tutorial program and 76.16% which both fall under *Fairly Satisfactory* gained a minimal increase of 0.54% increase is noted. In general, the average score before the tutorial program is 75.18% and 76.16% after, both of which are *Fairly Satisfactory* with an overall percentage increase of 0.98%.

Table 3
Respondent's Profile in terms of English Performance
n=30

School Year	Grades	Description	Before Tutorial		After Tutorial	
			F	**%**	**f**	**%**
1st batch n=30	90-100	Outstanding	0	0.00	0	0.00
	85-89	Very Satisfactory	0	0.00	0	0.00
	80-85	Satisfactory	0	0.00	0	0.00
	75-79	Fairly Satisfactory	11	36.67	21	70.00
	Below 75	Did Not Meet Expectation	19	63.33	9	30.00
	Average Score		73.33		74.63	
	Description		Did Not Meet Expectation		Did Not Meet Expectation	
	Percentage Increase		1.30%			
2nd batch n=30	90-100	Outstanding	0	0.00	0	0.00
	85-89	Very Satisfactory	0	0.00	0	0.00
	80-85	Satisfactory	0	0.00	1	3.33
	75-79	Fairly Satisfactory	21	70.00	27	90.00
	Below 75	Did Not Meet Expectation	9	30.00	2	6.67
	Average Score		75.07		76.07	
	Description		Fairly Satisfactory		Fairly Satisfactory	
	Percentage Increase		1.00%			
3rd batch n=30	90-100	Outstanding	1	3.33	1	3.33
	85-89	Very Satisfactory	0	0.00	0	0.00
	80-85	Satisfactory	5	16.67	6	20.00
	75-79	Fairly Satisfactory	21	66.67	22	73.33
	Below 75	Did Not Meet Expectation	3	10.00	1	3.33
	Average Score		77.23		77.77	
	Description		Fairly Satisfactory		Fairly Satisfactory	
	Percentage Increase		0.54%			

	90-100	Outstanding	1	1.11	1	1.11
	85-89	Very Satisfactory	0	0.00	0	0.00
	80-85	Satisfactory	5	5.56	7	7.78
OVERALL n=90	75-79	Fairly Satisfactory	53	58.89	70	77.78
	Below 75	Did Not Meet Expectation	31	34.44	12	13.33
	Average Score		75.18		76.16	
	Description		Fairly Satisfactory		Fairly Satisfactory	
	Percentage Increase		0.98%			

Shown in table 4 is the summary of result of correlated *t-test* for the analysis of Respondent's English performance of the three batches of respondents. Generally, there is a significant difference before and after the tutorial program.

Table 4

Analysis of Respondent's English Performance

School Year	Sources of Variation	Mean	Degree of Freedom	Computed t-value at 0.05 level of significance	Tabular t-value at 0.05 level of significance	Decision	Interpretation
2013-2014	Before the Reading Tutorial Class	73.23	29	-3.102	± 2.045	Reject H_o	Significant Difference
	After the Reading Tutorial Class	74.63					
2014-2015	Before the Reading Tutorial Class	75.07	29	-4.551	± 2.045	Reject H_o	Significant Difference
	After the Reading Tutorial Class	76.07					
2015-2016	Before the Reading Tutorial Class	77.23	29	-1.5617	± 2.045	Accept H_o	Not Significant Difference

	After the Reading Tutorial Class	77.77					
OVERALL	Before the Reading Tutorial Class	77.23	89	-4.803	± 1.987	Accept H_o	Significant Difference
	After the Reading Tutorial Class	77.77					

These results asserts that reading proficiency was clearly and positively related with children's school performance (Nyarko, Kugbey, Kofi, Cole, & Adentwi, 2018). This implies that the Reading Tutorial Class is much effective in increasing the reading performance. It further signifies that the conduct of the reading tutorial program by the College of Teacher Education, BISU Calape Campus should be continuously done to the recipient school.

CONCLUSION

The Cornerstone Reading Tutorial Program contributes progressive effect to the students' reading proficiency and English performance. Moreover, the reading proficiency of the pupils are associated to their English performance. The improvement of the pupil's reading proficiency through the tutorial program will aid them improve their English performance in school. Therefore, the Cornerstone Reading Tutorial Program collaboration with institutions will be a great operative which must be continuously executed in the next years to help pupils develop their reading proficiency and consequently, their English performance.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

REFERENCES

The Cornerstone Elementary Reading Tutorial, (n.d.). The Cornerstone Team Organizing, Resource and Evaluation Manual.

Angeli dos Santos, A. A., de Oliveira, K.L., Cunha, N.B.D and Osés, P.C.C. 2017. Effectiveness of an Intervention Program for Linguistics Skill Development. Ribeirao Preto Vol. 27 no. 67 http://dx.doi.org/10.1590/1982-43272767201705

Catts, H. W., Nielsen, D. C., Bridges, M. S., & Liu, Y. S. (2016).Early identification of reading comprehension difficulties. Journal of Learning Disabilities, 49(5), 451–465.

Department of Education. 2014. Benchmarks for Reading Performance in the Philippines. Department of Education Report.

Estrada, J.C.A. (2016). The Level of English Oral Reading Fluency among Abot – Alam Secondary Learners. World Journal of English Language Vol. 6, No. 3

Gough, P. B. and Tunmer, W. E. (1986) Decoding, reading and reading disability. Remedial and Special Education 7, 6-10.

Josephs, N. and Jolivette, K. (2016). Effects of Peer Mediated Instruction on the Oral Reading Fluency Skills of High School Aged Struggling Readers. Insights into Learning Disabilities 13(1), 39-59

Sookyung Cho. (2017). L1 Translation as Scaffolding in Tutor Talk: A Case Study of Two Korean Tutors. GEMA Online Journal of Language Studies Volume 17(2), =

Kirsch, I., Jong, J., Lafontaine, D., McQueen, J., Mendelovits, J., Monseur, J. (2002). Reading for change. Performance and Engagement Across Countries. Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development (OECD).

Dorval, B., Wallach, L., & Wallach, M. A. (1978). *Field evaluation of a tutorial reading program emphasizing phoneme identification skills.* The Reading Teacher 31(7), 784-790.

Beebe, J. & Balasa, M. A. (1976). *Letter and words: Tutorial reading activities.* The Reading Teacher 30(3), 338-339.

Nyarko, K., Kugbey, N., Kofi, C. C., Cole, Y. A., & Adentwi, K. I. (2018). English reading proficiency and academic performance among lower primary school children in Ghana. SAGE Open, 1–10. https://doi.org/DOI: 10.1177/2158244018797019